

University of Nottingham Rights Lab

> Evaluation of the Labour Exploitation, Education and Awareness Project delivered by the Gangmasters and Labour Abuse Authority and Boston College

June 2019

Alessia Cottone and Dr Alison Gardner The Rights Lab, University of Nottingham





Executive summary

The Gangmasters and Labour Abuse Authority (GLAA) commissioned this report from the University of Nottingham's Rights Lab. It evaluates a pilot education and awareness project on labour exploitation, undertaken in partnership with Boston College throughout the 2018/2019 academic year.

The objectives of the evaluation were:

- To explore knowledge and attitudes amongst students and staff in relation to labour exploitation and modern slavery;
- To understand perceptions of the activities undertaken as part of the project;
- To evaluate the effectiveness of the project in relation to its intended outcomes;
- To gain insights to inform future use of the resources developed for the project.



Still from a student-produced animation on labour exploitation. Credit: Tamara Sunina, Oskar Grabacz and Caitlyn Roberts

In order to create a reference point for the evaluation, a theory of change for the project was created in consultation with key stakeholders. The outcomes of the programme were subsequently tested against this theory of change through discussions involving students and staff who had participated in the project. The researchers undertook five focus groups with students, plus one further focus group with teachers, and used a thematic analysis to draw conclusions. This report discusses the findings in relation to five core areas:

- 1. Attitudes: reactions of students and staff to the material and the programme of activities;
- 2. Facilitators: elements which facilitated the learning and the teaching;
- 3. Outcomes: results produced by the intervention;
- 4. Pitfalls: areas for improvement;
- 5. Suggestions: potential strategies for future roll-out and implementation.

Overall, the report finds that the intervention was effective in achieving the intended outcome of increasing awareness of labour exploitation, but the impact of the intervention depended on the nature and degree of engagement with the topic of labour exploitation and modern slavery during the year. Thus, the online resources (slides, a video and a quiz) provided a general awareness and knowledge of exploitation, but classroom discussions produced a deeper understanding and learning transfer. Independent research and engagement in applied projects resulted in the strongest understanding of the mechanisms of labour exploitation. In some cases, students became advocates of fair treatment at work, and more aware of indicators of vulnerability in their community.

The report concludes with some recommendations for future development of the intervention, particularly in relation to course materials, teaching methods and content, and ensuring that students are supported to report potential labour abuses.

Introduction

Modern slavery has been described as the 'great human rights issue of our time'¹, with an estimated 40.3 million victims around the world, of which 16 million are thought to be victims of forced labour exploitation in the private economy.²

Labour exploitation can exist on a continuum, ranging from underpayment of basic pay and unsafe working conditions, through to forced labour, servitude and slavery. There are many reasons why workers may not report abuses, including personal vulnerabilities (such as language barriers or learning disabilities); a lack of awareness of labour rights; fear of the consequences of reporting; and a lack of knowledge or opportunities to access help.

Labour exploitation (including criminal exploitation) is currently the most common type of exploitation reported in the UK.³

The Gangmasters and Labour Abuse Authority (GLAA) has a single overarching aim: 'Working in partnership to protect vulnerable and exploited workers.' It is the foremost agency with responsibility for the investigation of labour market offences and allegations of forced labour across all sectors of the economy. Prevention is a key priority within the GLAA's strategic approach to tackling labour exploitation including tackling labour exploitation through education.

¹ UK Prime Minister Theresa May, writing in the Sunday Telegraph, 31 July 2016. Available at <u>https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/defeating-modern-slavery-theresa-may-article</u>

² Alliance 8.7 Global Estimates of Modern Slavery. Available at <u>https://www.alliance87.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/global estimates of modern slavery-forced labour and forced marriage-executive_summary.pdf</u>

³ National Referral Mechanism Statistics – End of Year summary 2018. Available at <u>https://nationalcrimeagency.gov.uk/who-we-are/publications/282-national-referral-mechanism-statistics-end-of-year-summary-2018/file</u>

The project

The GLAA and Boston College

Boston is a market town situated in Lincolnshire, in the East Midlands of the UK. Lincolnshire has seen high levels of inward migration from European countries such as Poland, Lithuania and Latvia, to provide labour for local businesses. The local area is dominated by agribusiness, with a high concentration of gangmasters (the intermediaries responsible for organising labour for the agriculture and food processing sectors). Gangmasters in the UK are monitored and licensed by the Gangmasters and Labour Abuse Authority (GLAA), but since April 2008, 14.2% of all UK license revocations were made in Lincolnshire, indicating a high prevalence of labour exploitation.

Boston College is a Further Education (FE) institution, focussed on preparing students aged 16-19 to enter the workforce, or further academic study, via a wide variety of vocational and academic courses. In 2018, a pilot project was conceived between the GLAA and Boston College, to proactively prevent labour exploitation through raising awareness with course tutors and students, improving knowledge of employment rights, and applying this knowledge to the specific vocational or academic courses that students were engaged in. It was also hoped that because students tended to live and work nearby, this intervention could - over the long term - make a wider impact on vulnerability to labour exploitation in the local area.

Importantly, given recognition of constrained resources in the FE sector, the project aimed to demonstrate that it was possible to implement an effective awareness and learning experience with modest resource input. The project also aspired to create a suite of resources that could enable other FE and Higher Education (HE) organisations to implement a similar programme.

This report evaluates the process of the intervention, assesses whether the project was effective in achieving its intended outcomes, and provides suggestions for the future development of this initiative.

Project overview

The rollout of the project included a number of different stages and interventions (see **Figure 1** on page 5). These included:

- A successful launch event receiving the endorsement of Minister for Crime, Safeguarding and Vulnerability Victoria Atkins, Lincolnshire Police and Crime Commissioner Marc Jones, and Member of Parliament for Boston and Skegness Matt Warman.
- An initial staff training session where Boston College staff received modern slavery and labour exploitation awareness training.
- Development of learning materials including interactive quizzes and teaching presentations. The tutorials were co-designed with the GLAA and then delivered across the College to 1,500 full-time students, apprentices and work-based learners.
- An Employment Rights and Responsibilities week, which featured 14 modern day slavery workshops. They were delivered by ACAS, Salvation Army and the GLAA and involved 250 learners and staff.

Figure 1: Timetable of programme activities



In addition, creative art and design projects were set as projects for over 100 students from Visual Arts & Media, with the objective of raising the profile of labour exploitation and modern-day slavery amongst consumers, workers or businesses. The students received two employment themed 'masterclasses' delivered by local employers and were then commissioned to design new concepts around raising awareness of modern slavery and labour exploitation. The students produced a variety of products ranging from photography, printed t-shirts, short films, animation, poetry and graphic art. These projects enabled a legacy to be created from the students' work by providing content for a multi-media platform of future course resources. The projects were also showcased at an event hosted by the Rights Lab at the University of Nottingham.

Description of the teaching resources

Over 200 college teaching and support staff were provided with a one-hour awareness and "spotting the signs" session from a member of GLAA staff, prior to the beginning of the academic year. This training had the objective of increasing staff knowledge around labour exploitation, increasing confidence in teaching the topic and establishing a supportive climate in the whole school. The safeguarding policy and procedures of the College were used as a guide to help staff to relate to the material. The initial training feedback indicated that while 60% of the staff claimed they knew something about labour exploitation before the training, the same proportion confirmed they had reached a good level of knowledge and understanding of the topic afterwards.

Teaching resources were designed to be available online, and modifiable according to the students' discipline and college's specific needs, so that other education providers would be able to easily implement a similar awareness initiative in a cost-effective and accessible way. The learning goals were increasing knowledge around different types of labour exploitation; identifying the mechanisms by which labour exploitation works; recognising the signs and indicators of exploitation and knowing whom to contact for help. The main teaching resources included interactive workshop slides, a video, a news piece and an online quiz. Workshops were devised to be highly interactive, involving tailored discussions for different courses. Students were also encouraged to investigate their own working conditions after the session.

Evaluation methodology

In order to provide a basis for the assessment, a 'theory of change' was created in consultation with key stakeholders at the GLAA and Boston College, articulating key objectives and intended outcomes of the project.

'Theory of change' was appropriate for this project as it is an effective means of capturing complex and evolving strategies, alongside assumptions about interventions and their effects. It also enables evaluators to compare intended outcomes of a project with actual results. The desired outcomes and impacts specified within the theory of change for this project were therefore compared with perceived outcomes through five focus groups with students, plus a further focus group with teachers. Thematic analysis was used to identify key messages from the data and to draw conclusions.

Theory of change for the Boston College intervention

Our theory of change (see **Figure 2**) helped to clarify the expected elements of the project, and guided analysis of project effectiveness.

It was predicted that as a result of the successful implementation of the project, there would be some shorter-term outcomes and longer-term impacts. The intended short-term outcomes centred on creating a supportive environment to increase staff awareness, knowledge and confidence in discussing labour exploitation, and improving student awareness and understanding of the issue, such that they would be able to recognise indicators of exploitation and apply their learning to everyday life.

Longer term, the GLAA and Boston College stakeholders hoped to see behavioural change in students when entering the workforce, so that students would be aware that they could act to prevent exploitation. They also anticipated that students would transmit what they had learned to their families, slowly leading to more community awareness. Through this transfer of knowledge, they aspired to create positive change in social norms at the community level, so that course participants and their contacts would recognise vulnerable individuals and be prepared to report possible cases of exploitation.

The assumptions within the theory of change were supported by learning theory. Firstly, at the student level, significant learning can be achieved by an engaging and high-energy process⁴ and with the help of a multimodal learning environment.⁵ Fiske defines significant learning as long-term learning which is not saved in the student "college file" but rather in their "life file".⁶ In this way, the student is able to link its past and current experiences in order to inform future ones, enhancing their individual and interpersonal life, and in turn becoming a more thoughtful citizen, prepared to enter the workplace.

Secondly, at the College level, research suggests that a supportive climate needs to be established by providing the necessary resources to staff (time, encouragement, recognition etc.), so they can confidently present the materials to the students.⁷ Ultimately, by involving different stakeholders and initiating discussion around the unacceptability of labour exploitation at the wider community level, social norms can be slowly changed.⁸

⁴ Fiske, S. T. and Taylor, S. E., 2013. Social cognition: From brains to culture. Sage Publications.

⁵ Moreno, R. and Mayer, R., 2007. 'Interactive multimodal learning environments'. In *Educational Psychology Review*, *19*(3), pp.309-326.

⁶ Fiske, S. T. and Taylor, S. E., 2013. Social cognition: From brains to culture. Sage Publications.

⁷ Collie, R. J. Shapka, J. D., and Perry, N. E., 2012. 'School climate and social–emotional learning: Predicting teacher stress, job satisfaction, and teaching efficacy'. In *Journal of Educational Psychology*, *104*(4), 1189. ⁸ Noar, S. M., 2006. 'A 10-year retrospective of research in health mass media campaigns: Where do we go from

here?' In Journal of Health Communication, 11(1), pp. 21-42.

Possible unintended outcomes

As with every social intervention, there were also a series of negative consequences and risks, which could result from the implementation of the programme. For example, teachers, who already managing a defined workload, could potentially have perceived the intervention as a burden. This could cause stress and limit their ability to effectively teach the material. In order to prevent this from happening, it was essential that support was given from the top of the institution. In addition, it was possible that some students, recognising situations of exploitation, could respond inappropriately to employers or endanger the wellbeing or safety of themselves or others. Directions therefore needed to be given to the students in order to address the problem with sensitivity.

Figure 2: Theory of Change for GLAA/ Boston College Pilot project



Data Collection

Focus group discussions were chosen as the most appropriate method of investigation due to the study's exploratory nature and our interest in understanding perceptions and attitudes towards the intervention⁹. Six focus groups were conducted, with each having between six and seven participants, and lasting around one hour.

⁹ Barbour, R. S. and Schostak, J., 2005. 'Interviewing and focus groups'. In Somekh, B. and Lewin, C. (Eds.) *Research methods in the social sciences* (pp. 41-48). Sage Publications.

Around 35 participants were recruited by Boston College, consisting of five groups of students and one group of teachers. The student groups were selected from three different curriculum areas (Creative Arts & Design; Social Care and Construction) with around six students in each. The lecturer group consisted of seven lecturers. All participants were provided with details about the study and assured that their data would be kept anonymous and any comments reported would not be attributable to individuals. Participants were also given the opportunity to ask questions and provided confirmation of consent to participate.

Data Analysis

The focus group discussions were audio recorded and transcribed verbatim. Responses were transcribed and analysed using thematic analysis¹⁰.

After carefully reading the transcripts to gain an overall understanding, codes were identified and grouped together. Five main themes were highlighted: attitudes, facilitators, outcomes, pitfalls and suggestions.



Image: Student response to Creative Arts brief. Credit: Maria Pasinato, Abbi Cox and Abigail Wilson

¹⁰ Boyatzis, R. E., 1998. *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*. Sage Publications.

Findings

Attitudes

This theme referred to students' reactions to workshops and activities. Four subthemes emerged in this regard. Firstly, most of the students acknowledged the fact that they experienced initial shock when the topic of labour exploitation was explained. Secondly, they recognised that labour exploitation was a difficult topic to think about, thus there was some resistance:

"At the beginning I wasn't interested at all (..) It's not a happy subject." (Arts).

In addition, some students saw the problem as distant – both historically and geographically:

"I didn't think it was a big thing, I thought it all ended fifty years ago and stayed in China, 'cause that's the stereotype." (Arts).

However, after the initial negative reaction, follow-up discussions helped them to realise that the topic was relevant:

"Initially they brought the resources and students didn't engage, it took them to the second tutorial to express themselves, to talk." (Staff).

Facilitators

Under this theme were grouped all the factors which made the learning more effective, long lasting and engaging. These were found to be:

- 1. relevance to their own life experience;
- 2. academic relevance;
- 3. interactivity;
- 4. time spent on the topic and application of learning;
- 5. resources.

1) Relevance to life experience:

Students who had entered the workplace appeared more confident and engaged, possibly because they recognised their own potential vulnerability, and saw the relevance of knowledge about labour exploitation:

"You have to make it clear that this could be their problem going forward, that this is the world they're coming into." (Arts).

The teaching staff also noticed a difference:

"When they told them about how they could be exploited, they were more switched on." (Staff).

2) Academic relevance:

When the activities were considered part of their academic curriculum and graded (as in the case of the Creative Arts group), students were more engaged. Students who also had similar modules such as Health and Safety also started referring to labour exploitation examples on their coursework:

"I was more focused on getting a passing the criteria and getting a good grade, but I learned things on the way." (Arts).

3) Interactivity:

An interactive element was essential to encouraging students to pay attention and remember the material. One way of achieving this was using multimodal learning (including a video and quiz). However, the original one-hour slide presentation was not considered sufficiently engaging by students without a discussion with their teacher. Some teachers asked students to do research independently and present their findings to the class:

"It was interesting because we did stuff, we didn't have to listen to her the whole time." (Social Care).

"...after you showed them the video and the slides, if they don't go and do their independent research it can hit a brick wall." (Staff).

4) Time:

The more time that was spent on the topic, the more students were able to remember. Being able to apply their learning through wider events as part of the pilot project (such as a promotional radio programme, and the awareness campaign for the arts group) provided a source of pride:

"...your material being part of a larger campaign also put your pride on the line, you have an extra inclination to make the stuff as good as you can make them." (Arts).

5) Resources:

It was essential that the teachers benefitted from as many resources as possible to ensure the information was targeted appropriately. The initial workshop for staff held in June was essential, but further support was also necessary:

"(the workshop in June) was a good starting point to know what resources are available and know where to guide the students." (Staff).

"It was useful for our awareness, it was an eye opener." (Staff).

"It could have been just another piece of staff development, but further workshops with the facilitators and the help of the statistics and the slides helped to put the material across and make it more meaningful." (Staff).

Outcomes of learning

Within the evaluation, a particular focus was given to finding out whether and to what extent an understanding of labour exploitation was achieved, and whether this knowledge was transferred to other domains. The first level was (1) **awareness**, which was increased by everyone who participated in the project. Both students and teachers said how little they knew before the workshops:

"If I didn't have this I wouldn't have known, so everyone should have it." (Social Care).

"Now I am more aware of the loophole and what people in our age group are entitled to." (Arts).

The goal, however, was not limited to increasing awareness, but also enabling students to apply their learning, thus being able to (2) **spot the signs** of labour exploitation, (3) **report** a case of labour exploitation and (4) **share their knowledge with others in their networks.**

The majority of the students affirmed that they generally felt more confident in identifying potential cases of labour exploitation, and that they were able to spot the signs and report it to the GLAA or to the police:

"Now I am walking around and thinking Is that person being exploited? I'll be at work and I'll think: are they exploiting me?" (Arts).

"Now knowing what's right and wrong, we would say something." (Building Services).

When talking about reporting however, this was closely linked to a feeling of **vulnerability and powerlessness**. Although aware of their right to report a situation of unfairness, the students were

also conscious about their position of vulnerability on the matter, and some stated that they would not feel confident to report because of the fear of losing their job.

"You might get sacked" (Social Care).

"Learning about it makes you realise how hard it is to report" (Building Services).

"We would not want to be seen as trouble makers" (Building services).

"When I start working I would call out my boss, but then they'd probably figure out a way to get out of it" (Arts).

This concern was also shared by some teachers:

"I sort of worry as well that some may take a lot of information, into somewhere up, am I right? It's a double edge sword in that respect." (Staff).

The more students had been involved with the project, the more they were willing to involve family and friends in discussions around labour exploitation. This was particularly relevant in relation to the experience of the creative arts students (see case study, below) The arts group, in particular, talked about the way their learning was challenging their former beliefs:

"It's giving me a new perspective on immigrants, there's a stigma around it. Now that stereotype is destroyed." (Arts).

However, students were also aware that talking about labour exploitation could be a cause of friction, and that they needed to have a pretext to start the conversation. This was easier for the ones who were more involved in the project:

"We would not start the conversation, if it was covered by the news, then we would feel comfortable" (Building Services).

"I wouldn't talk to others unless it's really needed. I wouldn't go and say 'oh I had a Power Point."" (Social Care).

There were also examples of students becoming advocates of a fair treatment at work (a number had part-time jobs outside college). For some, this meant actually going to their workplace and challenging their conditions, asking for a fairer pay:

"We feel like we could discuss some points with our employers if we are worried" (Social Care).

"Some went and challenged and got back pay" (Staff).

Pitfalls

In general, teaching materials were well-received. However, the main pitfall in the programme as it was implemented, related to the **slide presentation** that was given by either a member of the GLAA or a teacher, especially when no discussion was undertaken afterwards. Specifically, slides were said to be:

"... black and white and not really targeted to our age." (Social Care)

"...only centred around labour exploitation, could have explored other types." (Social Care)

However, criticism was less marked amongst those students who received additional activities on top of the slides.

A further aspect concerned the lack of clarity of some materials associated with the project:

"some questions (from the quiz) were misleading and the answers could have been clearer (..) I wasn't sure if answers were correct" (Building Group).

"(the brief) wasn't specific enough, it wasn't clear what they wanted" (Arts Group).

Some students also suggested that it would be beneficial to add some material regarding how to behave in a first job.

Case study: Creative Arts project

Arts and Design students at Boston College were commissioned by the GLAA to design new approaches to raising awareness of labour exploitation and modern slavery. The aim was to raise the profile of labour exploitation and modern slavery amongst consumers, workers or businesses and include a clear 'call to action'. In order to achieve this, staff from the GLAA organised visits to the College to offer their support and view progress of work. This work was graded and for most participants represented the first opportunity of work experience in their field. Completed projects were presented at the University of Nottingham on the 21 January 2019.

The work took a number of different practical forms:

- Students from the Art and Design course were invited to represent rough visual concepts relating to
 their ideas of labour exploitation. The concepts included videos, photographs, graphic designs and
 clothing. Five winning projects were to be selected and used by the GLAA as marketing tools to
 reach a younger audience. For example, a group of photography students were commissioned to visit
 to a construction site for a shoot to provide digital images to help illustrate the aims and objectives of
 the construction protocol (a joint agreement with some of the biggest names in UK construction,
 aimed at eradicating slavery and labour exploitation in the building industry.) This work is ongoing
 and may extend beyond the lifetime of the pilot project.
- A group of students from the Graphic Design course were also given the task to design a logo for the packaging of the company Fresh Time, based in Boston. This meant strict collaboration with a local company and gaining practical working experience.

Fulfilling the brief required students to do their own independent research about labour exploitation. This process not only brought them to a deeper sense of awareness and understanding of modern slavery, as they were forced to reflect on it in order to explain it to others; but it also transformed them into advocates of a fair treatment. In interviewing local people, they became aware of the stereotypes that surrounded this topic:

"There is that stereotype, that people from Boston think people from Eastern Europe are here because they are working cheaper. And now this is giving you a sense of like if they are working cheaper do they know they are working cheaper? It destroys the stereotype that they are ok with it. A lot of people think it it, maybe they say they don't but they do. So it makes you think, is this the case? Maybe they don't know, how they are living and it opens your eyes and makes you pull it apart."

In addition, they gained valuable insights into the strategies that can be used to engage the attention of young people to such sensitive topics:

"make it emotional, make people think about it, aware this will affect them too (..)You have to make people scared of this (..)another key element is consistency and repetition".

"you need to make material relatable. In social media, make it across in a way that a younger audience would be used to see it. A video not longer than 2 minutes".



Still from a student-produced animation on labour exploitation. Credit: Matt Fox.

External partners were also impressed by the impact of the learning. A manager from Freshtime commented:

"It was a small group of learners and they had limited time to come up with ideas. However they undertook some good research and came up with some credible, varied designs of good quality. Freshtime's packaging technologist was also present to discuss practical challenges of reproducing the design for display on-pack and I think the learners benefitted from the experience of a real brief for a real client...()

...One thing that really struck me was the knowledge and familiarity the group had with the subject of labour exploitation and slavery. They spoke about the sessions the GLAA delivered earlier in the year, which have clearly had a great impact in informing people of the issue. To go into a group of young people and there to be such an existing level of knowledge is really quite unusual and commendable."

Rollout and implementation

Suggestions for future implementation came from two main sources, the focus groups, plus an independent review of the learning resources by another further education institution, Nottingham College.

The main suggestions which were offered from the focus groups concerned the delivery process and technology. In general, the need for follow-up sessions was recognised as necessary in order for students to remember what was covered in the first workshop. This could take the form of returning to the topic as students reach different levels of qualification. Secondly, the Arts group and staff suggested that technology and social media could be used more for an effective engagement:

"Maybe give it to Level 1 before they go to work and at the end of Level 3 as a refresher before they start working" (Staff).

"Need for more interactive online material for teachers (..) the first point of call is doing stuff where they are looking, on their phones" (Staff).

In addition, as the perception of vulnerability was a common theme, students suggested that it might be helpful to include a case study of a survivor explaining how GLAA (and other agencies) could offer support:

"There is that fear of consequences, and if you realise that when you call the GLAA there are not going be consequences, it's a lot easier" (Design Group).

The GLAA and the Rights Lab were grateful to Nottingham College for providing a further review of learning materials, included at appendix 2 of this report. Their review covered both the learning resources produced and an earlier draft of this report.

The review broadly agreed that the objectives of the project had been met, and that the training resources were of good quality, easy to implement and suitable for most audiences. Some detailed suggestions were made on improving some of the materials and making them more interactive. Nottingham College also highlighted that as the involvement of the GLAA in the development of this project and staff training had been substantial, the GLAA should identify possible partners in different geographical areas who could give similar support to other colleges implementing the resources. In addition, a more condensed application of materials would be beneficial for colleges who do not have the time to dedicate numerous sessions to this topic.

Discussion and Conclusion

This report has evaluated the results of the GLAA / Boston College Project on labour exploitation, education and awareness through thematic analysis of six focus groups.

Overall, the intervention performed well against the theory of change envisaged by the GLAA and Boston College at the outset of the project. In particular, the intended outcomes for both staff and students were met. For staff, the project raised general awareness and increased their confidence in teaching the topic. For students, the initiative increased knowledge of labour exploitation, such that most students felt they could identify indicators of exploitation and would understand how to report concerns.

There was also some evidence that the project was challenging preconceived perceptions and attitudes about labour exploitation amongst those that had engaged most extensively with the topic. For some students, the intervention simply meant knowing more about their rights at work and labour exploitation in general. For others - especially those who discussed the topic in the classroom or carried out one of the applied projects - it led to challenging their own employers, and deeper understanding of the mechanisms that maintain labour exploitation in a community such as Boston. This suggests that the initiative has potential to achieve long-term impacts of changing social norms, as well as equipping students to apply their learning over the long-term in their workplaces, although students were also conscious that discussing the topic with family, friends and colleagues could be difficult. It is also important to note that both students and teachers identified a sense of vulnerability in reporting and sought further reassurance that they would not be penalised for reporting potential abuses.

To be effective, material had to be tailored as much as possible to their academic and / or working lives. We argue that the degree of transfer depended on the activities in which students were involved. There was a strong positive relationship between the students' degree of involvement and the outcomes reached. Thus, while the one-hour workshop generally increased awareness of labour exploitation, in order to reach behavioural change, further involvement was necessary. The following table illustrates how each activity was related to the intended outcomes, with the intensity of the colour indicating the strength of this relationship. When the programme was part of the academic curriculum, this led to a deeper analysis and understanding of the issue.

Intended Outcomes:

- 1. Awareness of Modern Slavery
- 2. Recognising signs and who to contact for help
- 3. Applying what they have learned to their own life
- 4. Integrating with other subjects (e.g. health and safety)
- 5. Changing attitudes about the topic
- 6. Awareness of wider implications



Legend. The four intensities represent the strength of the relationship between the outcome and each activity. They go from lighter blue (the outcome is not well-touched) to darker blue (outcome completely touched on)

In summary, this intervention proved to be an effective means of raising awareness about labour exploitation, and crucially, helping students to apply that knowledge to their own situation in an active and ongoing way. It was not an intervention that was high in cost, although the pilot drew much of its energy from the good relationship between the GLAA and Boston College. However, it is important to acknowledge that the GLAA was heavily engaged in this pilot, but is not currently resourced to provide the same level of support to other Further and Higher Education institutions looking to replicate the course.

Whilst this might be perceived as a challenge for future extensions of this project, other types of partners may be able to help fulfil this role. For instance, many local areas now have multi-agency antislavery partnerships that enable collaborations to support the type of external engagement modelled at Boston. Such partnerships could prove be a practical and locally-sensitive way to build on this important collaboration and extend it further.

Next Steps

Ongoing discussions are being held between the GLAA and Boston College to ensure that the findings of this report and the review by Nottingham College are taken into consideration and incorporated in future implementations of this project. The revised resources will then be aimed at a wider audience such as colleges, post-16 trainers and education policy makers.

Appendix 1: Quotations from the focus groups

Themes	Subthemes	Examples from focus groups quotes
1. Attitudes	Initial shock	"It is quite shocking because there are lots of cases" (Social care) "they were quite shocked about the information they were given" (Staff)
	Resistance	"At the beginning I wasn't interested at all () "It's not a happy subject" (Arts) "People don't want to talk or think about it" (Building)
	Need of time to feel involved	"Initially they brought the resources and students didn't engage", "It took them to the second tutorial to express themselves, to talk" (Staff)
2. Facilitators	Relevance to their own life	"We had the confidence booster of working in a professional body" (Arts) "if they haven't worked it would just go over their heads" (Staff) "when they told them about how <u>they</u> could be exploited, they were more switched on", "It's about trying to find things that would make it relatable to them, not just a Power Point, having videos and resources" (Staff) "You have to make it clear that this could be their problem going forward, that this is the world they're coming into"
	Academic relevance	"I was more focused on getting a passing the criteria and getting a good grade, but I learned things on the way", "It's a nice thing to put on your portfolio" (Arts).
	Interactivity	"When they were speaking about it no one really paid attention but when they showed the video then we were more concentrated", "We felt the quiz helped us retain the knowledge" (Building Services) "It was interesting because we did stuff, we didn't have to listen to her the whole time", "I think I would have remembered more if the presentation was more interactive and exciting" (Social Care) "after you showed them the video and the slides, if they don't go and do their independent research it can hit a brick wall" (Staff)
	Follow-up	"I would have used a follow-up. Because I can't remember much about the project now" (Social Care)
	Involvement in other events	"your material being part of a larger campaign also put your pride on the line, you have an extra inclination to make the stuff as good as you can make them" (Arts)

Themes	Subthemes	Examples from focus groups quotes
	Teachers' resources	"(the workshop in June) was a good starting point to know what resources are available and know where to guide the students" "It could have been just another piece of staff development, but further workshops with the facilitators and the help of the statistics and the slides helped to put the material across and make it more meaningful", "It was useful for our awareness, it was an eye opener"(Staff)
3. Outcomes of learning	Awareness	"I didn't know much before, and I didn't realised it happened in the UK" (Social Care) "I didn't think it was a big thing, I thoughts it all ended fifty years ago and stayed in China, cause that's the stereotype" (Arts) "It was useful to know, "if I didn't have this I wouldn't have known, so everyone should have it" (Social Care), "Now I am more aware of the loophole and what people in our age group are entitled to" (Arts) "If it was spoke about it more it wouldn't happen as much", "It's giving me a new perspective on immigrants, there's a stigma around it. now that stereotype is destroyed" (Arts)
	Spotting the signs	"Now I am walking around and thinking Is that person being exploited? I'll be at work and I'll think: are they exploiting me?" (Arts)
	Reporting	"If they feel confident in reporting, then they can take that at whatever stage of their career" (Staff) "Now that we know what is right and wrong, we would say something",
	Sense of vulnerability and powerlessness	"you might get sacked", "learning about it makes you realise how hard it is to report" (Social Care) When I start working I would call out my boss, but then they'd probably figure out a way to get out with it (Arts), "We would not want to be seen as trouble makers" (Building services) "if they take the information somewhere up I worry () it's a double edged sword" (Staff)
	Talking to others	"I got the gist but I wouldn't be able to explain it to others", "I wouldn't talk to others unless it's really needed. I wouldn't go and say oh I had a Power Point (Social Care) "We would not start the conversation, if it was covered by the news, then we would feel comfortable" "discussing it locally could cause some friction" (Building)
	Challenging others	"We feel like we could discuss some points with our employers if we are worried", "We would help people and give them advice, what they decide to do with that is up to them" (Social Care) "Some went and challenge and got back pay"
4. Pitfalls	Presentation	"The Power Point was black and white and not really targeted to our age" (Social Care)

Themes	Subthemes	Examples from focus groups quotes
	Lack of clarity	"Some answers of the quiz were unclear" (Building)
5. Suggestions	Use of technology	"We could use more information about the signs, more examples of different types of exploitation" "It should be more colorful and targeted to our age" (Social Care), "We would like more quizzes"
	Delivery	"Need to make the material on social media, like a short video, make it more emotional (), it has to shock people, make them paranoid, repeat it and make it constant" (Arts) "Need for more interactive online material for teachers, the first point of call is doing stuff where they are looking, on their phones" "School assembly could be a good way of getting it out there"
		"Maybe give it to Level 1 before they go to work and at the end of Level 3 as a refresher before they start working" (Staff)



Boston College Modern Slavery Awareness project Review of draft evaluation report and resources created by Boston College students and staff.

Firstly, can I say what an honour and privilege it has been to be to be able to review this project and the work done to raise awareness of Modern Slavery at Boston College.

The group reviewing the project was made up of 4 people from the Programme of Study department, who collectively have an eclectic mix of specialisms and responsibilities.

- Manager of Programme of Study Managing, developing and reviewing associated teams/projects that form part of the Programme of Study. Designate for Looked After Young People & Safeguarding.
- 2 x Emotional Behavioural Disorder (EBD) Specialist Lecturers lead learning support development within the programmes of study, guiding and co-ordinating the work of other team members and curriculum colleagues to achieve planned outcomes which includes the development and delivery of specialist tutorial packages. Safeguarding Designates.
- Achievement Coach Co-ordinator. The Co-ordinator will monitor and review associated resources, delivery and systems across college to ensure Achievement Coaches effectively and consistently meet the needs of students.

Overview of Resources

Overall the suite of resources developed were of a good quality and would be easy to roll out in any organisation.

Fresh produce- Student induction presentation

Students did a really good job with this, however we felt that a voice over would have improved this presentation as there was a strong emphasis on being able to read and not just understand spoken language.

Fresh produce info sheet – Student produced

The content given was relevant and informative and gave a good representation of the company.

The font type/size, colour is a bit difficult to read – it was felt that looking at the company webpage, other colours could have been used.

GLAA

The text that rolled across the screen was difficult to read at times due to the speed it scrolled at. Weren't able to view the Modern Slavery video as the file was a PDF.

Spotting the signs – gave an abstract representation of thing to look out for with an emphasis on key points – different approach to regular bullet points. The process feels similar to those where people are groomed for other purposes so can appear the same and therefore requires a keen eye to differentiate.

Challenges slide – Aware that this is more relevant to over 18s and our target audience is 16 – 18 so perhaps something that makes it more relevant to the audience.

Tighter link to safeguarding and personalised to the organisation or education establishment.

Salvation Army

Gave the history of the SA, useful for building in to the presentation and the cause. Some terminology needed a little investigation which became clearer, later in the presentation. NRM, AVMS. The GLAA video presentation gave a really clear insight into modern slavery and highlighted another area where it wouldn't be assumed that criminals would be operating i.e. taking person who were being exploited to work at another business.

In summary

There is a clear representation for audiences to access something suitable for most audiences and or organisations or education establishments.

College presentations and resources were generic to allow them to be used across other colleges, which is very useful.

Simplicity of the message to be able to slot in to an organisation/college.

Overview of Evaluation Report

The report is clear and well written, much of it reflects the views that we held when reviewing the resources. The report references the students feeling that the power point slides were not interactive or engaging enough, it doesn't say what the resulting action will be following this feedback. Are there going to be changes made to ensure that the materials released, capture the audience better for a one off session? Some of the content is informative but could have a better impact if presented differently. Some Colleges may not have the time in their tutorial framework to dedicate more than one or two sessions (safeguarding aspect/ employability aspect) to this, the resources need to reflect this.

The report also highlights the need for facilitated classroom discussions in order to ensure maximum understanding. This is something that we have experienced this year in our own tutorials and the feedback received from students where the materials have been either online or unengaging.

The report also highlights that the GLAA have been heavily involved in the delivery with Boston College and that this may not be possible to all Colleges. I think where possible it is key to ensure staff feel trained and confident in the subject matter in order to facilitate the discussions with students and have the biggest impact on learning. It would be helpful within the resources for the GLAA to identify partners in different geographical areas that can provide training and support to staff teams who will deliver the materials where they are not able to.

I felt it was interesting that the report highlighted that although many students now felt they knew what their rights were, they wouldn't necessarily feel empowered to challenge any infringement on these rights. Maybe there could be additional resources for second year students that could support this.

The report shows the importance of having this subject within the tutorial framework and where possible in the curriculum areas. It shows that the project has achieved its objectives and that many of the resources can be rolled out for use by other educational establishments with support from the GLAA.

Vicki Stockdale

Manager of Programme of Study Designate for Looked After Young People & Safeguarding Nottingham College

Discover more about our world-class research

nottingham.ac.uk/rights-lab

rightslab@nottingham.ac.uk @rightsbeacon

© University of Nottingham 2019. All rights reserved. Published July 2019.